The Grand Commandery of Boigny and the Grand Priory of France after 1968

Chev. Le Comte d’Évora

Abstract

As a consequence of the rebellion early in 1969, the 46th Grand Master, lost most of the Grand Priory of France, including its legal entities, to the Brissac-administration and the Scottish recognition of the Order was made dormant. In the circumstances, it is not surprising that Boigny was seen as the link to the legitimate Order’s continued presence in France; eventually resulting in the creation of the Delegation of Boigny by the Malta Obedience, a new Jurisdiction which was in 1977, raised to the status of a Grand Bailiwick. For the purpose of re-establishing law and order in the Order, the Duc de Nemours, eminently assisted by his Grand Referendary Colonel Gayre of Gayre & Nigg, issued a number of important Constitutional Decrees. Decree N° 2 / 1969 reads “The Titular Seat of the Order is Boigny of which the Grand Master is Grand Commander”; and Decree N° 34 / 1969 states that “Among the jurisdictions of the Order are certain hereditary commanderies among which are the senior Commandery of de la Motte de Courtils, the Commandery of Boigny which constitutes a jurisdiction of the same character as a hereditary commandery vested in the Grand Master for the time being”.

Introduction

In 1147, out remorse for an intemperate act of violence that had cost many innocent lives, the King of France, Louis VII, embarked on a pilgrimage to the Holy Land to atone for his sins. It is recorded that the humility, the piety, and the dedication to the poor lepers demonstrated by the Brothers of Saint Lazarus made such an impression on the King that, at his request, twelve Lazarites accompanied him to France in July 1149, thereby implanting their fraternity into his kingdom. In 1154, Louis VII confirmed his benevolent intentions by endowing the Brothers of Saint Lazarus of Jerusalem with his royal domain at Boigny-sur-Bionne, near Orléans. It is further recorded that, exactly 100 years later, on his return
from the Holy Land in 1254, Saint Louis (IX), having realised the precarious situation of what was left of the Latin Kingdom, brought with him the Master of Saint Lazarus, Brother Raynaud de Flory, and installed him at Boigny.¹ From the Mémoires, Règles, Statuts, Cérémonies, et Privilèges des Ordres Militaires de Nostre Dame du Mont Carmel et de S. Lazare de Jérusalem, printed in Lyon in 1649, we learn that this was the time when encumbered by struggle, to demonstrate their confidence in their vocation, the Brothers of Saint Lazarus adopted the green colour of hope for their cross.² Thus, in 1254, the Commandery of Boigny became the Magisterial Seat of the Order with the Grand Master, ex officio, as Commander.³

In this context, it is important to remember that the pre-1772 Commandery of the Order of Saint Lazarus was an ecclesiastical benefice, not unlike a prebend, providing revenue for the incumbent and for the Order. Generally, it consisted of a semi-fortified house with a chapel, a farm, and living quarters for the Commander, for his Chaplain and for his staff. The appointment to a Commandery was, therefore, a reward for long and faithful service to the Order and its aims. Despite warfare and the vicissitudes of time, Boigny remained the Grand Magisterial Seat of the Order until its confiscation by the Specific Law N°1007 of the 28th March 1792, the Loi relative à l’emploi des biens des ci-devant Ordres royaux, hospitaliers & militaires de Nostre-Dame de Mont Carmel & de Saint-Lazare de Jérusalem, signed by the King Louis XVI.

² Memoires, Regles et Statuts, Ceremonies et Privileges des Ordres Militaires de Nostre Dame du Mont Carmel et de S. Lazare de Jerusalem. Lyon: Antoine Cellier, 1649, p.38.
First half of the 20th century

It is not surprising therefore that because of this historical tradition, at the time of the re-organization of the Order in France in the early part of the 20th century, Boigny was declared to be the titular Grand Magisterial Seat of the Order, in a manner similar to the use in the Catholic Church of titles in partibus infidelium, i.e. ancient, no longer existing, dioceses in the Middle-East, for bishops and archbishops without pastoral jurisdiction.

The Grand Priory of France was established in 1927 with the Marquis de l’Église de Ferrier de Félix as first Grand Prior (1927-1944), followed by Prince Henri de Béarn et Chalais (1944-1947), and from 1954 the Duc de Brissac. Due to requirements imposed by his military career, the 45th Grand Master, Don Francisco Enrique de Borbón y de Borbón had little time to devote to the Order and, on the 30th June 1956 to remedy with this situation, he appointed Pierre Timoléon de Cossé-Brissac 12th Duc de Brissac as Administrator General of the Order.

Turmoil within the International Order

Initially, this arrangement appeared to work well but early in 1967, the Duc de Brissac, seconded by the Grand Capitular Paul Bertrand de la Grassière, staged a coup d’état and declared a sedis vacans and convoked a Chapter General in Paris on the 25th May 1967. At the conclusion of this Chapter General, it was solemnly declared that His Royal Highness Prince Charles-Philippe d’Orléans, Duc de Nemours, de Vendôme & d’Alençon, had been elected 46th Grand Master of the Order. This election brought the Order considerable kudos and enabled the recording of the Order’s armorial bearings by the Lord Lyon King of Arms, entailing official recognition of the Order by the Crown in Scotland.

Although the Duc de Nemours was a Grand Cross of Justice since 1941 and thus was by no means a novice in the Order. However, it would

appear that he had been misled in respect of the legality of the deposition of his predecessor and his own election. However, he came to an understanding with his deposed predecessor and the Duc de Nemours was acknowledged as the rightful titular incumbent of the historic Magisterial Commandery of Boigny, by virtue of being at the time the duly acknowledged Grand Master of the Order. Indeed, the contentious *Règles, Statuts et Coutumes de l’Ordre de Saint-Lazare de Jérusalem* of the 30th January 1968 state that: “Le Siège de l’Ordre Militaire et Hospitalier de Saint-Lazare de Jérusalem a été successivement à Jérusalem (1099-1187, Saint-Jean d’Acre (1191-1291, Boigny (1291-1790) : il fut ensuite à Paris et à Madrid. Depuis le 20 mars 1967 le Siège Magistral de l’Ordre a été rétabli à Boigny” [Article 3]. Thus on the 20th March 1967, the Magisterial Seat of the Order was re-established at Boigny.

The Duc de Nemours was an “action-man” and the harmony of cooperation between the new Grand Master and the Duc de Brissac proved short-lived. The Duc de Nemours was overtly anglophile and happily married to a charming American, Marguerite néé Watson. The Scottish Laird, Colonel Robert Gayre of Gayre & Nigg, Baron of Lochore, who was promoting the Order all over the Anglo-Saxon world, became a close friend of the Grand Master and of his consort. To cap it all, the Duc de Nemours, inspired by the ecumenical movement promoted by the 2nd Vatican Council, decided to open up the Order for full membership of non-Catholic Christians. The administration at the Grand-Chancellery in Paris felt threatened and staged a new *coup d’état*, this time against the Duc de Nemours and Colonel Gayre of Gayre & Nigg. As a consequence of the rebellion early in 1969, the 46th Grand Master lost most of the Grand Priory of France, including its legal entities, to the Brissac-administration and the Scottish recognition of the Order made dormant. In the circumstances, it is not surprising that Boigny was seen as the link to the legitimate Order’s continued presence in France; eventually resulting in

---

5 Eventually in 1973, Don Francisco Enrique de Borbón y de Borbón was to succeed Prince Charles-Philippe d’Orléans as the 47th Grand Master.

the creation of a new Jurisdiction known as the Delegation of Boigny by the Malta Obedience, which in 1977 was raised to the status of a Grand Bailiwick.

For the purpose of re-establishing law and order in the Order, the Duc de Nemours, eminently assisted by his Grand Referendary Colonel Gayre of Gayre & Nigg, issued a number of important Constitutional Decrees.⁷

There we find:

Decree N° 1/1969:
- “The following Decrees, when taken together with all earlier Decrees, Rules, Statutes, and Bye-Laws, constitute the Manual of Law of the Order.”
- “…” Older Decrees, Rules, Statutes, and Bye-Laws, remain in force where they are not inconsistent with these Decrees now published.”

In respect of the present subject matter, we find two Decrees that clarify the status of the historic Commandery of Boigny:

Decree N° 2 / 1969 reads:
- “The Titular Seat of the Order is Boigny of which the Grand Master is Grand Commander.”

Decree N° 34 / 1969 states that:
- “Among the jurisdictions of the Order are certain hereditary commanderies among which are the senior Commandery of de la Motte de Courtils, the Commandery of Boigny which constitutes a jurisdiction of the same character as a hereditary commandery vested in the Grand Master for the time being”.

---

Sadly, the Duke of Nemours died unexpectedly on the 10th March 1970.

The Constitutional Decrees, promulgated under Magisterial Decree N° 55, of the 15th May 1979, (47th Grand Master, Don Francisco Enrique de Borbón y de Borbón), Section 105 (page 17), reflect the earlier Statutes by including the Grand Commandery of Boigny in the list of Hereditary Commanderies. Decree N° 55 / 1979 reads:

- “The following Hereditary Commanderies depend directly from the Grand Master and are not subject to the local jurisdictions within whose geographic territory they exist: The Commandery of de la Motte Courtits; The Grand Commandery of Boigny; ...”

Turning to the Constitution, Statutes and Regulations of the Order of St. Lazarus of Jerusalem – Malta Obedience, issued under Magisterial Decree N° 17/99, of 8th October 1999, (48th Grand Master, the Duke of Seville), it is found that:

- “The spiritual (titular) seat of the Order will be the place so established by the Grand Master, at the moment at Château Boigny, France.” (Art. 1.10)

- “According to ancient customs, the following traditional Hereditary Commanderies are known, installed centuries ago, but not at all times active: Boigny (near Orléans, France)” ... (Art. 5.10.)

The Boigny jurisdiction under the Malta Obedience

---

9 Constitution, Statutes and Regulations of the Order of St. Lazarus of Jerusalem - Malta Obedience: Magisterial Decree No. 17/99, 1999
Leaving the pre-21st century corpus of legislation of the Order, we now turn to references to Boigny in the printed reports from Grand Magisterial Council meetings.

The Report of the Grand Magistral Council, held in Malta on the 3rd to 5th October 1969 contains a supplement in respect of “Administrative Orders and Re-Organisational Procedures issued by authority of the Grand Master of the 20th October 1969” in which we read:


Having established that the historic Grand Magisterial Commandery of Boigny has the status of a hereditary commandery, held ex officio by the Grand Master during his tenure of office, we now turn to official references to the creation and existence of the Delegation of Boigny, eventually elevated to the status of Grand Bailiwick.

The Report of the Grand Magistral Council held in Liège on the 3rd and 4th June 1972 reads:

JURISDICTIONS:
- Grand Bailiwicks and Grand Priories: Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, USA, Ireland, England Scotland.
- Bailiwicks and Priories: Armenia (in exile), Malta, Hungary (in exile), Rumania, New Zealand, Rhodesia, South Africa.
- Commanderies: Lochore, Hereditary, Holy Trinity (Canada)
- Delegations: Australia, Belgium, Denmark and Greenland, Finland, Boigny (France), Hong Kong, Iceland, Gozo, Nicaragua, Portuguese Tongue, Venezuela, Germany.

10 Idem, p 29
ACTIVITIES:

During the past year Delegations were set up in Portugal … Nicaragua, Germany, Boigny (France), Venezuela and Gozo.

The pamphlet entitled “Outline of the History of the Military and Hospitaller Order of Saint Lazarus of Jerusalem” written by the Grand Commander Gayre of Gayre & Nigg reports that: “In France, the Grand Master, considering himself the titular Commander of Boigny, set up a Delegation, and to it adhered also the majority of the members of the old Ambulance Corps which existed formerly in France.”

In an excerpt from an address by H. Exc. The Much Honoured The Laird of Gayre of Gayre & Nigg, Baron of Lochore GCLJ pp, Grand Commander of the Order, at the Inauguration of the Grand Chancery at Castell ta Lanzun (Malta) on Saturday the 12th May 1973, we read: “The Order is once more regaining its strength. Its Titular Seat lies in Madrid,” … “The Titular Commandery of the Grand Master is Boigny, in France, and here we have the Seat of the Administration, where the day to day business of the Order is transacted.” The following day, a Chapter General was held and it is recorded that “The following Jurisdictions were represented at the Chapter General : America, Boigny (France), Denmark and Greenland, England, Finland, Hungary, Ireland, Lochore, Malta and Gozo, Portugal, Scotland, South Africa, Spain. The following Jurisdictions were represented by proxy: Sweden, Rumania, Holy Trinity (Canada), and New Zealand.”


208
represented in person, among those the “Delegation of Boigny (France)” and four Jurisdictions represented by proxy.\textsuperscript{14}

The Report of the Grand Magistral Council held in Malta on the 23\textsuperscript{rd}–24\textsuperscript{th} September 1977 reports the presence of “Delegations from the following Jurisdictions: “The Priory of Alsace, The Grand Priory of America, The Delegation of Austria, The Bailiwick of Boigny, The Canadian Jurisdiction” and 11 more jurisdictions. In addition “The following Jurisdictions were raised to the status of Grand Priories / Grand Bailiwicks or to that of Priory : ... “The Grand Bailliage of Boigny with Chevalier Jean de Beaugourdon as Prior.” “During the financial year May 1976 to April 1977, Chancery Fees were received from the following Jurisdictions: The Priory of Alsace, The Grand Priory of America, The Bailiwick of Boigny” and eleven more jurisdictions.\textsuperscript{15}

The Report of the Grand Magistral Council held in Edinburgh, Scotland on the 23–24\textsuperscript{th} June 1980 states that: “Regrets for absence were received from several Members amongst whom: ... “Chev. J. de Beaugourdon, Grand Banner Bearer and Grand Bailiff of the Bailiwick of Boigny.”\textsuperscript{16}

The Armorial of the Military and Hospitaller Order of Saint Lazarus of Jerusalem\textsuperscript{17} lists 14 members of the Grand Bailiwick of Boigny, of whom three are recorded as being honorary:

- The Grand Master of the Order, Don Francisco Enrique de Borbón y de Borbón  GCLJ

\textsuperscript{14} The Military and Hospitaller Order of Saint Lazarus of Jerusalem - Report of the Grand Magistral Council held in Edinburgh, Scotland, 29\textsuperscript{th}-30\textsuperscript{th} August 1974. MHOSLJ, 1974, p.2.
\textsuperscript{17} Algrant y Canete & de Beaugourdon, op. cit., pp.304, 364-381.
• Her Royal Highness the Dowager Duchesse de Nemours DGCLJ, and
• General Raoul Salan GCMLJ (a Grand Cross of the Companionate of Merit; not a member of the Order).

The other members included:
• S.E. Le Chevalier Jean de Saint-Vincent de Beaugourdon GCLJ KMLJ KL, Grand Bailiff, Grand Banner Bearer, (1971);
• Claude Guillaume-Petit KCLJ, Chancellor, (1975)
• Andréani de Tallane DLJ (1976)
• Pierre Girard-Augry KLJ (1978)
• Philippe Queval KLJ (1978)
• François Leriget KLJ (1981)
• Renaud de Saint-Vincent de Beaugourdon KLJ (1982)
• Thiery G X Pointet, KLJ (1982)
• Jean F A Barbou KLJ (1972)
• François-Xavier Sorlot CLJ (1975), and
• Madame F X Sorlot CLJ (1975).

Apart from the Grand Bailiwick of Boigny, the Armorial mentions one other Jurisdiction of the Order in France belonging to the Malta-Obedience, the Grand Priory of the Alsace, which at that time, had 49 living members. The same Armorial lists a total of 360 members of the French Grand Priory from 1927 to 1968 but no members of the Paris-Obedience admitted after that year.

In consequence of the above information and considering that the then Grand Master was not the Head of Jurisdiction of the Grand Bailiwick of Boigny but an honorary member thereof, the logical conclusion must be that the Grand Bailiwick of Boigny, originally established as a Delegation in 1969/70, promoted before 1977 to the status of Bailiwick and raised at the GMCM in Malta in 1977 was a different entity from that of the historical Grand Magisterial Commandery of Boigny and that, although there being only a subtle difference in the nomenclature, this in fact preserved intact the traditional status of the Grand Commandery of
Boigny as well as the Grand Master’s prerogative of being the Grand Commander of Boigny!

N.B. To avoid any possible confusion with the historic Magisterial Commandery of Boigny, when the Delegation of Boigny was elevated in status, it was promoted to that of a Bailiwick, the intermediate status of Commandery being passed over.

Article 7.3.i of the Constitution, Statutes and Regulations of the Order of St. Lazarus of Jerusalem – Malta Obedience, issued under Magisterial Decree N° 17/99, of the 8th October 1999 by the 48th Grand Master, the Duke of Seville, states that:

- “As a rule, each Member forms part of his National Jurisdiction. If this Jurisdiction is divided into sub-jurisdictions, the Member may join one sub-jurisdiction acting in its region.”

As the two former Obediences of Malta and of Paris and the “Norwich Group” were reunited in 2008 under one Grand Master, His late Excellency the Marquis de Almazan, the Grand Priory of France became again the National Jurisdiction of France. However, the Grand Bailiwick of Boigny, having well served its purpose, was not wound up and its members integrated into the Grand Priory of France. It would appear that the then Grand Prior, The Duchesse de Brissac GCLJ and the then Grand Bailiff of Boigny, The Chevalier Roman Bour KCLJ, did not quite see eye to eye.

Some years ago, a myth was created claiming that the Grand Bailiwick of Boigny was, in fact, the historic Magisterial Grand Commandery of Boigny and that the nomenclature ought to be corrected to express this “fact” and, in due course the Late Grand Master was persuaded to acquiesce. However, the Late Grand Master’s Grand Magisterial Decree N° 44/11, renaming the Grand Bailiwick of Boigny and calling it “The Grand Commandery of Boigny”, did not alter the true historical situation. He was innocently ignorant of the real situation and obviously ill advised. The evidence that he was unaware of his actual position in respect of
Boigny is the last part of his Decree N° 44/11, of the 18th May 2011: «We do hereby decree: The Grand Master will take his historical title of Grand Commander of Boigny of the Military and Hospitaler Order of Saint Lazarus of Jerusalem, as of the 18th day of May in the year of our Lord 2011.» The fact is, however, that the Marquis de Almazan already was the Commander of the Magisterial (Grand) Commandery of Boigny from the moment of his Installation as Grand Master of the Order on 13th September 2008 in the St Mary’s Cathedral in Manchester, U.K. As the Decree N° 44/11 lacks the required countersignatures and seals, it was at first of doubtful validity but eventually ratified among no less than 179 other Grand Magisterial Decrees by Decree N° 77/11 on 2nd September 2011.

Considering the pertinent historical facts referred to above, and as it is inconceivable that the then Government of the Order would have degraded the Grand Magisterial Commandery of Boigny to the inferior status of a mere Delegation, the claim made by the present “Grande Commanderie de Boigny” to be the Magisterial Commandery of Boigny is based on inaccurate interpretation of relevant matters and, therefore, unsustainable! As a matter of fact, the Grand Magistral Decree N°41/11 of the 18th May 2011, stipulates that: “…after the reunification of our Order between the former Paris Obedience, the former Malta Obedience, and the former Norwich Group there would be only one national jurisdiction per country, and by means of this Grand Magistral Decree, We do hereby decree: The Grand Priory of France is the sole authorized national jurisdiction of the Military and Hospitaler Order of Saint Lazarus of Jerusalem in France, with H.E. La Duchesse de Brissac, DGCLJ, as Grand Prior as of the 18th day of May in the year of our Lord 2011.”

In apparent contravention to the above-mentioned Decree, the Grand Bailliage de Boigny (sic!) pretends parity with the Grand Priory of France by claiming on page 4 of a well-designed pamphlet, distributed in connexion with an Investiture at Avignon in Spring 2017:
NOTRE ORGANISATION ACTUELLE : L’Ordre de Saint Lazare est présent dans une quarantaine de pays” ... “Il est actif en France à travers deux organisations : Le Grand Bailliage de Boigny et le Grand Prieuré de France. Ces deux juridictions sont composées de commanderies et provinces sur tout le territoire de la République”.

In English: “OUR CURRENT ORGANISATION: The Order of Saint Lazarus is present in some forty countries” ... “It is active in France through two organisations: The Grand Bailiwick of Boigny and the Grand Priory of France. These two Jurisdictions are composed of Commanderies and Provinces covering the whole of the territory of the Republic.”

On the other hand, in order to promote unity in the Order in France, the Grand Priory of Alsace was integrated into the Grand Priory of France in 2010 and, latterly, two formerly separated Jurisdictions have joined forces with the Grand Priory of France and sworn allegiance to the late Grand Master:

- On the 19th June 2016, the former Grand Priory of France, until the 3rd April 2016 under the administration of His Royal Highness The Prince Sixte-Henry de Bourbon de Parme, now the Grand Bailiwick of France; and
- On the 18th June 2017, the formerly independent Lieutenancy of the Military & Hospitaller Order of Saint Lazarus of Jerusalem and of Our Lady of Mount Carmel.

Looking at the legal situation of Boigny in the light of the Manual of Law of the Order, it is evident that the current Constitution gives little guidance in respect of the present matter. The Byelaws of 2016, however, stipulate that:

- “There shall be no more than one National Jurisdiction per country”. (Art. 2.3.3.)
- “For historical purposes, there are an exclusive number of Grand Commanderies that depend directly from the Grand Master, are
installed by him and are not subject to the National Jurisdictions within whose geographic territory they exist”. (Art. 2.10.1.)

- “The Grand Master shall be the Grand Commander of a Grand Commandery”. (Art. 2.10.1.)
- “Grand Commanderies may not have Commanderies or other Sub-Jurisdictions”. (Art. 2.10.1.)

The Grand Commandery of Boigny, however, is divided into four “Provinces” (a term that does not exist in the Order’s current vocabulary), each led by a Knight Commander.\(^{18}\)

As we have seen above, the Grand Magisterial Commandery of Boigny has the status of an ex officio hereditary commandery of which the Grand Master is the Head. The current Byelaws of the Order stipulate that:

- “Not less than 51 % of the members of a Hereditary Commandery must belong to the family of the Hereditary Commander.” (Art. 2.11.3.)

The Grand Commandery of Boigny now has about 150 members.\(^{19}\)

**Conclusions**

Taking into account that:

1. The creation of the Delegation / Bailiwick / Grand Bailiwick of Boigny was a “political” expedient in the wake of the Brissac rebellion of January 1969 to assure the continued presence of the legitimate Order in France;
2. That the Grand Bailiwick of Boigny had fulfilled its purpose as soon as the Order was re-united in 2008 under one Grand Master and the Grand Priory of France was returned to the legitimate Grand Magistery of the Order;

---

\(^{18}\) Roman Bour. *La Grande Commanderie de Boigny (GCB)* dated 28\(^{th}\) February 2018, p 5 [S. E. le Chevalier Commendeur Roman Bour GB-GCLI, Commendeur émérite de la Grande Commanderie de Boigny]

\(^{19}\) *Idem.*
3. That the Grand Bailiwick of Boigny, juridically, was not the same entity as the Grand Magisterial Commandery of Boigny, historically belonging exclusively to the prerogative of the Grand Master for his personal apanage, the change of nomenclature of the Grand Bailiwick of Boigny in 2011 to that of the “Grand Commandery of Boigny” (GM Decree N° 42/11, of 18th May 2011) was un-called for and is, in the circumstances, confusing.

It is hoped that, for the good of the Order in France and out of respect for the Order’s ancient tradition, the present form of existence of the Grande Commanderie de Boigny be reconsidered by the Government of the Order and the historic Grand Magisterial Commandery of Boigny restored to its traditional status and structure and having, apart from the Grand Master, as members only the Coadjutor and, ex officio, the most senior Members of the Government of the Order who, for the sake of preserving impartiality in matters concerning the various Jurisdictions of the Order, by virtue of their High Offices, should not belong to a national Jurisdiction or even the International Grand Bailiwick, thus, potentially being subject to the authority of its Head of Jurisdiction.

*In Fidem,*

*Meursault, ut supra,*